

PRESBYTERY OF NEW YORK.

✓
THE PRESBYTERIAN CHURCH IN THE
UNITED STATES OF AMERICA,

AGAINST

THE REV. CHARLES A. BRIGGS, D.D.

A MENDED CHARGES AND SPECIFICATIONS
AS DELIVERED TO DR. BRIGGS BY THE
MODERATOR IN OPEN SESSION OF JUDICA-
TORY. NOVEMBER 9TH. 1892.

THE PRESBYTERIAN CHURCH IN THE UNITED STATES OF
AMERICA,

Represented by

GEORGE W. F. BIRCH, D. D.,
JOSEPH J. LAMPE, D. D.,
ROBERT F. SAMPLE, D. D.,
JOHN J. STEVENSON,
JOHN J. MCCOOK,

} Prosecuting
Committee.

PRESBYTERY OF NEW YORK.

THE PRESBYTERIAN CHURCH IN THE
UNITED STATES OF AMERICA,

AGAINST

THE REV. CHARLES A. BRIGGS, D.D.

AMENDED CHARGES AND SPECIFICATIONS
AS DELIVERED TO DR. BRIGGS BY THE
MODERATOR IN OPEN SESSION OF JUDICA-
TORY, NOVEMBER 9TH, 1892.

THE PRESBYTERIAN CHURCH IN THE UNITED STATES OF
AMERICA,

Represented by

GEORGE W. F. BIRCH, D. D.,
JOSEPH J. LAMPE, D. D.,
ROBERT F. SAMPLE, D. D.,
JOHN J. STEVENSON,
JOHN J. MCCOOK,

} Prosecuting
Committee.

PRESS OF
DOUGLAS TAYLOR
3 WARREN ST.
N. Y.

PRESBYTERY OF NEW YORK.

THE PRESBYTERIAN CHURCH IN THE UNITED STATES
OF AMERICA

AGAINST

THE REV. CHARLES A. BRIGGS, D.D.

AMENDED CHARGES AND SPECIFICATIONS.

CHARGE I.

The Presbyterian Church in the United States of America charges the Rev. Charles A. Briggs, D.D., being a Minister of the said Church and a member of the Presbytery of New York, with teaching that the Reason is a fountain of divine authority which may and does savingly enlighten men, even such men as reject the Scriptures as the authoritative proclamation of the will of God and reject also the way of salvation through the mediation and sacrifice of the Son of God as revealed therein; which is contrary to the essential doctrine of the Holy Scripture and of the Standards of the said Church, that the Holy Scripture is most necessary, and the rule of faith and practice.

SPECIFICATION 1.

In an Inaugural Address, which the said Rev. Charles A. Briggs, D.D., delivered at the Union Theological Seminary in the City of New York, January 20th, 1891, on the occasion of his induction into the Edward Robinson Chair of Biblical Theology, which Address has been published and extensively circulated with the knowledge and approval of the said Rev. Charles A. Briggs, D.D., and has been

republished by him in a second edition with a preface and an appendix, there occur the following sentences,

Page 24, lines 7-10 and 31-33 :

“ Divine authority is the only authority to which man can yield implicit obedience, on which he can rest in loving certainty and build with joyous confidence. * * * There are historically three great fountains of divine authority—the Bible, the Church, and the Reason.”

Page 27, lines 9 to 21 :

“ Martineau could not find divine authority in the Church or the Bible, but he did find God enthroned in his own soul. There are those who would refuse these rationalists a place in the company of the faithful. But they forget that the essential thing is to find God and divine certainty, and if these men have found God without the mediation of Church and Bible, Church and Bible are means and not ends; they are avenues to God, but are not God. We regret that these rationalists depreciate the means of grace so essential to most of us, but we are warned lest we commit a similar error, and depreciate the reason and the Christian consciousness.”

Inaugural Address, Appendix, Second Edition, pages 88, 89 :

“(c.) Unless God’s authority is discerned in the forms of the Reason, there is no ground upon which any of the heathen could ever have been saved, for they know nothing of Bible or Church. If they are not savingly enlightened by the Light of the World in the forms of the Reason the whole heathen world is lost forever.”

SPECIFICATION II.

In an Inaugural Address, which the said Rev. Charles A. Briggs, D.D., delivered at the Union Theological Seminary in the City of New York, January 20th, 1891 on the

occasion of his induction into the Edward Robinson Chair of Biblical Theology, which Address has been published and extensively circulated with the knowledge and approval of the said Rev. Charles A. Briggs, D.D., and has been republished by him in a second edition with a preface and an appendix, there occur the following sentences :

Page 28, lines 1 to 22 :

“(3.) *The Authority of Holy Scripture*.—We have examined the Church and the Reason as seats of divine authority in an introduction to our theme, *the Authority of the Scriptures*, because they open our eyes to see mistakes that are common to the three departments. Protestant Christianity builds its faith and life on the divine authority contained in the Scriptures, and too often depreciates the Church and the Reason. Spurgeon is an example of the average modern Evangelical, who holds the Protestant position, and assails the Church and Reason in the interest of the authority of Scripture. But the average opinion of the Christian world would not assign him a higher place in the kingdom of God than Martineau or Newman. May we not conclude, on the whole, that these three representative Christians of our time, living in or near the world’s metropolis, have, each in his way, found God and rested on divine authority? May we not learn from them not to depreciate any of the means whereby God makes himself known to men? Men are influenced by their temperaments and environments which of the three ways of access to God they may pursue.”

These declarations are contrary to Scripture :

Isaiah viii. 20. To the law and to the testimony: if they speak not according to this word, *it is* because *there is* no light in them.

Matt. x. 32, 33.—32 Whosoever therefore shall confess me before men, him will I confess also before my Father

which is in heaven. 33 But whosoever shall deny me before men, him will I also deny before my Father which is in heaven.

Luke xvi. 29–31.—29 Abraham saith unto him, They have Moses and the prophets; let them hear them. 30 And he said, Nay, father Abraham: but if one went unto them from the dead, they will repent. 31 And he said unto him, If they hear not Moses and the prophets, neither will they be persuaded, though one rose from the dead.

John v. 39. Search the Scriptures; for in them ye think ye have eternal life; And they are they which testify of me.

John xiv. 6. Jesus saith unto him, I am the way, and the truth, and the life: no man cometh unto the Father, but by me.

1 John v. 10. He that believeth on the Son of God hath the witness in himself: he that believeth not God hath made him a liar, because he believeth not the record that God gave of his Son.

Gal. i. 9. As we said before, so say I now again, If any *man* preach any other gospel unto you than that ye have received, let him be accursed.

2 Timothy iii. 15–17.—15 And that from a child thou hast known the Holy Scriptures, which are able to make thee wise unto salvation through faith which is in Christ Jesus. 16 All Scripture *is* given by inspiration of God, and *is* profitable for doctrine, for reproof, for correction, for instruction in righteousness: 17 That the man of God may be perfect, thoroughly furnished unto all good works.

2 Peter i. 19–21.—19 We have also a more sure word of prophecy; whereunto ye do well that ye take heed, as unto a light that shineth in a dark place, until the day dawn, and the day star arise in your hearts: 20 Knowing this first, that no prophecy of the Scripture is of any

private interpretation. 21 For the prophecy came not in old time by the will of man: but holy men of God spake *as they were moved by the Holy Ghost.*

These declarations are contrary to the Standards:

Confession of Faith, Chap. I., Secs. I., V., VI., X.

I. Although the light of nature, and the works of creation and providence, do so far manifest the goodness, wisdom, and power of God, as to leave men inexcusable; *yet they are not sufficient to give that knowledge of God, and of his will, which is necessary unto salvation; therefore it pleased the Lord, at sundry times, and in divers manners, to reveal himself, and to declare that his will unto his church; and afterwards, for the better preserving and propagating of the truth, and for the more sure establishment and comfort of the church against the corruption of the flesh, and the malice of Satan and of the world, to commit the same wholly unto writing: which maketh the Holy Scripture to be most necessary;* those former ways of God's revealing his will unto his people being now ceased.

V. We may be moved and induced by the testimony of the church to an high and reverent esteem for the Holy Scripture; and the heavenliness of the matter, the efficacy of the doctrine, the majesty of the style, the consent of all the parts, the scope of the whole, (which is to give all glory to God,) the full discovery it makes of *the only way of man's salvation*, the many other incomparable excellencies, and the entire perfection thereof, are arguments whereby it doth abundantly evidence itself to be the word of God; yet, notwithstanding, our full persuasion and assurance of the infallible truth, and divine authority thereof, is from the inward work of the Holy Spirit, *bearing witness by and with the word in our hearts.*

VI. *The whole counsel of God, concerning all things necessary for his own glory, man's salvation, faith, and life, is either expressly set down in Scripture, or by good and necessary consequence may be deduced from Scripture: unto which nothing at any time is to be added, whether by new revelations of the Spirit, or traditions of men.* Nevertheless we acknowledge the inward illumination of the Spirit of God to be necessary for the saving understanding of such things as are revealed in the word; and that there are some circumstances concerning the worship of God, and government of the church, common to human actions and societies, which are to be ordered by the light of nature and Christian prudence, according to the general rules of the word, which are always to be observed.

X. *The Supreme Judge, by which all controversies of religion are to be determined, and all decrees of councils, opinions of ancient writers, doctrines of men, and private spirits, are to be examined, and in whose sentence we are to rest, can be no other but the Holy Spirit speaking in the Scripture.*

Larger Catechism.

Q. 2. *How doth it appear that there is a God?*

A. The very light of nature in man, and the works of God, declare plainly that there is a God; *but his word and Spirit only*, do sufficiently and effectually reveal him unto men for their salvation,

Q. 3. *What is the word of God?*

A. The Holy Scriptures of the Old and New Testament are the word of God, *the only rule of faith and obedience.*
Shorter Catechism.

Q. 2. *What rule hath God given to direct us how we may glorify and enjoy him?*

A. The word of God, which is contained in the Scriptures of the Old and New Testaments, is the *only rule to direct us how we may glorify and enjoy him.*

CHARGE II.

The Presbyterian Church in the United States of America charges the Rev. Charles A. Briggs, D.D., being a Minister of the said Church and a member of the Presbytery of New York, with teaching that the Church is a fountain of divine authority which, apart from the Holy Scripture, may and does savingly enlighten men: which is contrary to the essential doctrine of the Holy Scripture and of the Standards of the said Church, that the Holy Scripture is most necessary and the rule of faith and practice.

SPECIFICATION I.

In an Inaugural Address, which the said Rev. Charles A. Briggs, D.D., delivered at the Union Theological Seminary in the City of New York, January 20th, 1891, on the occasion of his induction into the Edward Robinson Chair of Biblical Theology, which Address has been published and extensively circulated with the knowledge and approval of the said Rev. Charles A. Briggs, D.D., and has been republished by him in a second edition with a preface and an appendix, there occur the following sentences:

Page 24, lines 7-10 and 31-33:

“Divine authority is the only authority to which man can yield implicit obedience, on which he can rest in loving certainty and build with joyous confidence. * * * There are historically three great fountains of divine authority—the Bible, the Church, and the Reason.

Page 25, lines 1 to 14 inclusive.

“(1.) *The Authority of the Church*.—The majority of Christians from the apostolic age have found God through the Church. Martyrs and Saints, Fathers and Schoolmen, the profoundest intellects, the saintliest lives, have had this experience. Institutional Christianity has been to them the presence-chamber of God. They have therein and thereby entered into communion with all saints. It is difficult for many Protestants to regard this experience as any other than pious illusion and delusion. But what shall we say of a modern like Newman, who could not reach certainty, striving never so hard, through the Bible or the Reason, but who did find divine authority in the institutions of the Church?”

SPECIFICATION II.

In an Inaugural Address, which the said Rev. Charles A. Briggs, D.D., delivered at the Union Theological Seminary in the City of New York, January 20th, 1891, on the occasion of his induction into the Edward Robinson Chair of Biblical Theology, which Address has been published and extensively circulated with the knowledge and approval of the said Rev. Charles A. Briggs, D.D., and has been republished by him in a second edition with a preface and an appendix, there occur the following sentences :

Page 28, lines 1 to 22, are :

“(3.) *The Authority of Holy Scripture*.—We have examined the Church and the Reason as seats of divine authority in an introduction to our theme, the *Authority of the Scriptures*, because they open our eyes to see mistakes that are common to the three departments. Protestant Christianity builds its faith and life on the divine authority contained

in the Scriptures, and too often depreciates the Church and the Reason. Spurgeon is an example of the average modern Evangelical, who holds the Protestant position, and assails the Church and Reason in the interest of the authority of Scripture. But the average opinion of the Christian world would not assign him a higher place in the kingdom of God than Martineau or Newman. May we not conclude, on the whole, that these three representative Christians of our time, living in or near the world's metropolis, have, each in his way, found God and rested on divine authority? May we not learn from them not to depreciate any of the means whereby God makes himself known to men? Men are influenced by their temperaments and environments which of the three ways of access to God they may pursue."

These declarations are contrary to the Holy Scripture.

Isaiah viii. 20. To the law and to the testimony: if they speak not according to this word, *it is* because *there is* no light in them.

Matt. x. 32, 33.—32 Whosoever therefore shall confess me before men, him will I confess also before my Father which is in heaven. 33 But whosoever shall deny me before men, him will I also deny before my Father which is in heaven.

Luke xvi. 29–31.—29 Abraham saith unto him, They have Moses and the prophets; let them hear them. 30 And he said, Nay, father Abraham; but if one went unto them from the dead, they will repent. 31 And he said unto him, If they hear not Moses and the prophets, neither will they be persuaded, though one rose from the dead.

John v. 39. Search the Scriptures; for in them ye think ye have eternal life; And they are they which testify of me.

John xiv. 6. Jesus saith unto him, I am the way, and

the truth and the life: no man cometh unto the Father but by me.

1 John v. 10. He that believeth on the Son of God hath the witness in himself: he that believeth not God, hath made him a liar, because he believeth not the record that God gave of his Son.

Gal. i. 9. As we said before, so say I now again, if any *man* preach any other gospel unto you than that ye have received, let him be accursed.

2 Timothy iii. 15–17.—15 And that from a child thou hast known the Holy Scriptures, which are able to make thee wise unto salvation through faith which is in Christ Jesus. 16 All Scripture *is* given by inspiration of God, and *is* profitable for doctrine, for reproof, for correction, for instruction in righteousness: 17 That the man of God may be perfect, thoroughly furnished unto all good works.

2 Peter i. 19–21.—19 We have also a more sure word of prophecy; whereunto ye do well that ye take heed, as unto a light that shineth in a dark place, until the day dawn, and the day star arise in your hearts: 20 Knowing this first, that no prophecy of the Scripture is of any private interpretation. 21 For the prophecy came not in old time by the will of man: but holy men of God spake *as they were* moved by the Holy Ghost.

These declarations are contrary to the Standards:

Confession of Faith, Chap. I., Secs. I., V., VI., X.

I. Although the light of nature, and the works of creation and providence, do so far manifest the goodness, wisdom, and power of God, as to leave men inexcusable; *yet they are not sufficient to give that knowledge of God, and of his will, which is necessary unto salvation; therefore it pleased the Lord, at sundry times, and in divers man-*

ners, to reveal himself, and *to declare that his will* unto his church; *and afterwards* for the better preserving and propagating of the truth, and for the more sure establishment and comfort of the church against the corruption of the flesh, and the malice of Satan and of the world, to *commit the same wholly unto writing: which maketh the Holy Scripture to be most necessary*; those former ways of God's revealing his will unto his people being now ceased.

V. We may be moved and induced by the testimony of the church to an high and reverent esteem for the Holy Scripture; and the heavenliness of the matter, the efficacy of the doctrine, the majesty of the style, the consent of all the parts, the scope of the whole, (which is to give all glory to God,) the full discovery it makes of *the only way of man's salvation*, the many other incomparable excellencies, and the entire perfection thereof, are arguments whereby it doth abundantly evidence itself to be the word of God; yet notwithstanding, our full persuasion and assurance of the infallible truth, and divine authority thereof, is from the inward work of the Holy Spirit, *bearing witness by and with the word in our hearts*.

VI. *The whole counsel of God, concerning all things necessary for his own glory, man's salvation, faith, and life, is either expressly set down in Scripture, or by good and necessary consequence may be deduced from Scripture: unto which nothing at any time is to be added, whether by new revelations of the Spirit, or traditions of men.* Nevertheless we acknowledge the inward illumination of the Spirit of God to be necessary for the saving understanding of such things as are revealed in the word; and that there are some circumstances concerning the worship of God, and government of the church, common to

human actions and societies, which are to be ordered by the light of nature and Christian prudence, according to the general rules of the word, which are always to be observed.

X. *The Supreme Judge*, by which all controversies of religion are to be determined, and all decrees of councils, opinions of ancient writers, doctrines of men, and private spirits, are to be examined, and in whose sentence we are to rest, *can be no other but the Holy Spirit speaking in the Scripture.*

Larger Catechism.

Q. 2. *How doth it appear that there is a God?*

A. The very light of nature in man, and the works of God, declare plainly that there is a God; *but his word and Spirit only*, do sufficiently and effectually reveal him unto men for their salvation.

Q. 3. *What is the word of God?*

A. The Holy Scriptures of the Old and New Testament are the word of God, *the only rule of faith and obedience.*

Shorter Catechism.

Q. 2. *What rule hath God given to direct us how we may glorify and enjoy him?*

A. The word of God, which is contained in the Scriptures of the Old and New Testaments, is the *only rule to direct us how we may glorify and enjoy him.*

CHARGE III.

The Presbyterian Church in the United States of America charges the Rev. Charles A. Briggs, D.D., being a Minister of the said Church and a member of the Presbytery of New York, with teaching that errors may have

existed in the original text of the Holy Scripture, as it came from its authors, which is contrary to the essential doctrine taught in the Holy Scripture and in the Standards of the said Church, that the Holy Scripture is the Word of God written, immediately inspired, and the rule of faith and practice.

SPECIFICATION.

In an Inaugural Address, which the said Rev. Charles A. Briggs, D.D., delivered at the Union Theological Seminary in the City of New York, January 20th, 1891, on the occasion of his induction into the Edward Robinson Chair of Biblical Theology, which Address has been published and extensively circulated with the knowledge and approval of the said Rev. Charles A. Briggs, D.D., and has been republished by him in a second edition with a preface and an appendix, there occur the following sentences, beginning with line 4 of page 35 :

“ I shall venture to affirm that, so far as I can see, there are errors in the Scriptures that no one has been able to explain away ; and the theory that they were not in the original text is sheer assumption, upon which no mind can rest with certainty. If such errors destroy the authority of the Bible, it is already destroyed for historians. Men cannot shut their eyes to truth and fact. But on what authority do these theologians drive men from the Bible by this theory of inerrancy? The Bible itself nowhere makes this claim. The creeds of the Church nowhere sanction it. It is a ghost of modern evangelicalism to frighten children. The Bible has maintained its authority with the best scholars of our time, who with open minds have been willing to recognize any error that might be pointed out by Historical Criticism ; for these errors are all in the circumstantials and not in the essentials ; they are in the human setting, not in the precious jewel

itself; they are found in that section of the Bible that theologians commonly account for from the providential superintendence of the mind of the author, as distinguished from divine revelation itself. It may be that this providential superintendence gives infallible guidance in every particular; and it may be that it differs but little, if at all, from the providential superintendence of the fathers and schoolmen and theologians of the Christian Church. It is not important for our purpose that we should decide this question. If we should abandon the whole field of providential superintendence so far as inspiration and divine authority are concerned and limit divine inspiration and authority to the essential contents of the Bible, to its religion, faith, and morals, we would still have ample room to seek divine authority where alone it is essential, or even important, in the teaching that guides our devotions, our thinking, and our conduct.”

These declarations are contrary to the statements of Scripture:

Zech. vii. 12. Yea, they made their hearts *as* an adamant stone, lest they should hear the law, and the words which the Lord of hosts hath sent in his Spirit by the former prophets: therefore came a great wrath from the Lord of hosts.

Mark vii. 13. Making the work of God of none effect through you tradition, which ye have delivered: and many such like things do ye.

Romans iii. 1, 2.—1 What advantage then hath the Jew? or what profit *is there* of circumcision? 2 Much every way: chiefly, because that unto them were committed the oracles of God.

1 Cor. ii. 13. Which things also we speak, not in the words which man's wisdom teacheth, but which the Holy Ghost teacheth; comparing spiritual things with spiritual.

Galatians iii. 8. And the Scripture, foreseeing that God would justify the heathen through faith, preached before the Gospel unto Abraham, *saying*, In thee shall all nations be blessed.

2 Pet. i. 20, 21.—20 Knowing this first, that no prophecy of the Scripture is of any private interpretation. 21 For the prophecy came not in old time by the will of man: but holy men of God spake *as they were* moved by the Holy Ghost.

2 Tim. iii. 16. All Scripture *is* given by inspiration of God, and *is* profitable for doctrine, for reproof, for correction, for instruction in righteousness.

These statements are contrary to the Standards.

Confession of Faith, Chap. I., Secs. I., II., IV., VIII.

I. Although the light of nature, and the works of creation and providence, do so far manifest the goodness, wisdom, and power of God, as to leave men inexcusable; yet are they not sufficient to give that knowledge of God, and of his will, which is necessary unto salvation; *therefore it pleased the Lord, at sundry times, and in divers manners, to reveal himself, and to declare that his will unto his Church; and afterwards, for the better preserving and propagating of the truth, and for the more sure establishment and comfort of the church against the corruption of the flesh, and the malice of Satan and of the world, to commit the same wholly unto writing: which maketh the Holy Scripture to be most necessary; those former ways of God's revealing his will unto his people being now ceased.*

II. Under the name of Holy Scripture, or *the word of God written*, are now contained all the books of the Old and New Testament, which are these:

OF THE OLD TESTAMENT.

Genesis.	II. Chronicles.	Daniel.
Exodus.	Ezra.	Hosea.
Leviticus.	Nehemiah.	Joel.
Numbers.	Esther.	Amos.
Deuteronomy.	Job.	Obadiah.
Joshua.	Psalms.	Jonah.
Judges.	Proverbs.	Micah.
Ruth.	Ecclesiastes.	Nahum.
I. Samuel.	The Song of Songs.	Habakkuk.
II. Samuel.	Isaiah.	Zephaniah.
I. Kings.	Jeremiah.	Haggai.
II. Kings.	Lamentations.	Zechariah.
I. Chronicles.	Ezekiel.	Malachi.

OF THE NEW TESTAMENT.

The Gospels according to Matthew, Mark, Luke, John.	Corinthians, II.	The Epistle to the Hebrews.
The Acts of the Apostles.	Galatians.	The Epistle of James.
Paul's Epistles to the Romans.	Ephesians.	The first and second Epistles of Peter.
Corinthians, I.	Philippians.	The first, second and third Epistles of John.
	Colossians.	The Epistle of Jude.
	Thessalonians, I.	The Revelation.
	Thessalonians, II.	
	To Timothy, I.	
	To Timothy, II.	
	To Titus.	
	To Philemon.	

All which are given by inspiration of God, to be the rule of faith and life.

IV. *The authority of the Holy Scripture, (for which it ought to be believed and obeyed, dependeth not upon the testimony of any man or church, but wholly upon God, (who is truth itself,) the author thereof; and therefore it is to be received, because it is the word of God.*

VIII. The Old Testament in Hebrew, (which was the native language of the people of God of old,) and the New Testament in Greek, (which at the time of the writing of

it was most generally known to the nations,) *being immediately inspired by God*, and by his singular care and providence, kept pure in all ages, are therefore authentic; so as in all controversies of religion the Church is finally to appeal unto them. But because these original tongues are not known to all the people of God who have right unto, and interest in the Scriptures, and are commanded, in the fear of God, to read and search them, therefore they are to be translated into the vulgar language of every nation unto which they come, that the word of God dwelling plentifully in all, they may worship him in an acceptable manner, and, through patience and comfort of the Scriptures, may have hope.

CHARGE IV.

The Presbyterian Church in the United States of America charges the Rev. Charles A. Briggs, D.D, being a Minister in said Church and a member of the Presbytery of New York, with teaching that many of the Old Testament predictions have been reversed by history, and that the great body of Messianic prediction has not been and cannot be fulfilled, which is contrary to the essential doctrine of Holy Scripture and of the Standards of the said Church, that God is true, omniscient and unchangeable.

SPECIFICATION.

In an Inaugural Address, which the said Rev. Charles A. Briggs, D.D., delivered at the Union Theological Seminary in the City of New York, January 20th, 1891, on the occasion of his induction into the Edward Robinson Chair of Biblical Theology, which Address has been published and extensively circulated with the knowledge and approval of the said Rev. Charles A. Briggs, D.D., and has

been republished by him in a second edition with a preface and an appendix, there occur the following sentences :

Page 38, lines 20 to 30 :

“(6.) *Minute Prediction*.—Another barrier to the Bible has been the interpretation put upon *Predictive Prophecy*, making it a sort of history before the time, and looking anxiously for the fulfillment of the details of Biblical prediction. Kuenen has shown that if we insist upon the fulfillment of the details of the predictive prophecy of the Old Testament, many of these predictions have been reversed by history ; and the great body of the Messianic prediction has not only never been fulfilled, but cannot now be fulfilled, for the reason that its own time has passed forever.”

This declaration is contrary to Scripture :

Matt. v. 17, 18.—17 Think not I am come to destroy the law, or the prophets : I am not come to destroy, but to fulfil. 18 For verily I say unto you, Till heaven and earth pass, one jot or one tittle shall in no wise pass from the law, till all be fulfilled.

Matt. xxiv. 15. When ye, therefore, shall see the abomination of desolation, spoken of by Daniel the prophet, stand in the holy place, (whoso readeth, let him understand.)

Dan. xii. 11. And from the time *that* the daily *sacrifice* shall be taken away, and the abomination that maketh desolate set up, *there shall be* a thousand two hundred and ninety days.

Luke xxiv. 44. And he said unto them, These *are* the words which I spake unto you, while I was yet with you, that all things must be fulfilled which were written in the law of Moses, and *in* the prophets, and *in* the psalms concerning me.

Exodus xxxiv. 6. And the Lord passed by before him, and proclaimed, The Lord, The Lord God, merciful and gracious, long suffering, and abundant in goodness and truth.

Hebrews iv. 13. Neither is there any creature that is not manifest in his sight: but all things *are* naked and opened unto the eyes of him with whom we have to do.

James i. 17. Every good gift and every perfect gift is from above, and cometh down from the Father of lights, with whom is no variableness, neither shadow of turning.

This declaration is contrary to the Standards :

Confession of Faith, Chap. I., Section IV.

The authority of the Holy Scripture, for which it ought to be believed and obeyed, *dependeth* not upon the testimony of any man or church, but *wholly upon God*, (*who is truth itself*), *the author thereof*; and therefore it is to be received, because it is the word of God.

Chap. II., Sec. I., II.

I. There is but one only living and true God, who is infinite in being and perfection, a most pure spirit, invisible, without body, parts, or passions, *immutable*, immense, eternal, incomprehensible, almighty, *most wise*, most holy, most free, most absolute, *working all things according to the counsel of his own immutable and most righteous will*, for his own glory; most loving, gracious, merciful, long suffering, *abundant in goodness and truth*, forgiving iniquity, transgression and sin; the rewarder of them that diligently seek him; and withal most just and terrible in his judgments; hating all sin, and who will by no means clear the guilty.

II. God hath all life, glory, goodness, blessedness, in and of himself; and is alone in and unto himself all-sufficient, not standing in need of any creatures which he

hath made, nor deriving any glory from them, but only manifesting his own glory in, by, unto and upon them: he is the alone fountain of all being, of whom, through whom, and to whom, are all things: and hath most sovereign dominion over them, to do by them, for them, or upon them, whatsoever himself pleaseth. *In his sight all things are open and manifest; his knowledge is infinite, infallible, and independent upon the creature, so as nothing is to him contingent or uncertain.* He is most holy in all his counsels, in all his works, and in all his commands. To him is due from angels and men, and every other creature, whatsoever worship, service, or obedience, he is pleased to require of them.

Shorter Catechism.

Q. 4. *What is God?*

A. God is a Spirit, infinite, eternal, and unchangeable, in his being, wisdom, power, holiness, justice, goodness, and truth.

CHARGE V.

The Presbyterian Church in the United States of America charges the Rev. Charles A. Briggs, D.D., being a Minister of the said Church and a member of the Presbytery of New York, with teaching that Moses is not the author of the Pentateuch, which is contrary to direct statements of Holy Scripture and to the essential doctrines of the Standards of the said Church, that the Holy Scripture evidences itself to be the word of God by the consent of all the parts, and that the infallible rule of interpretation of Scripture is the Scripture itself.

SPECIFICATION.

In an Inaugural Address, which the said Rev. Charles A. Briggs, D.D., delivered at the Union Theological Semi-

nary in the City of New York, January 20th, 1891, on the occasion of his induction into the Edward Robinson Chair of Biblical Theology, which Address has been published and extensively circulated with the knowledge and approval of the said Rev. Charles A. Briggs, D.D., and has been republished by him in a second edition with a preface and an appendix, there occurs the following sentence :

Page 33, lines 6-8.

“ It may be regarded as the certain result of the science of the Higher Criticism that Moses did not write the Pentateuch.”

This declaration is contrary to direct statements of Scripture.

Ex. xxiv. 4. And Moses wrote all the words of the Lord, and rose up early in the morning, and builded an altar under the hill, and twelve pillars according to the twelve tribes of Israel.

Num. xxxiii. 2. And Moses wrote their goings out according to their journeys by the commandment of the Lord: and these *are* their journeys according to their goings out.

Deut. v. 31. But as for thee, stand thou here by me, and I will speak unto thee all the commandments, and the statutes, and the judgments, which thou shalt teach them, that they may do *them* in the land which I give them to possess it.

Deut. xxxi. 9. And Moses wrote this law, and delivered it unto the priests the sons of Levi, which bare the ark of the covenant of the Lord, and unto all the elders of Israel.

Josh. i. 7, 8.—7 Only be thou strong and very courageous, that thou mayest observe to do according to all the law

which Moses my servant commanded thee: turn not from it *to* the right hand or *to* the left, that thou mayest prosper whithersoever thou goest. 8 This book of the law shall not depart out of thy mouth; but thou shalt meditate therein day and night, that thou mayest observe to do according to all that is written therein: for then thou shalt make thy way prosperous, and then thou shalt have good success.

1 Kings ii. 3. And keep the charge of the Lord thy God, to walk in his ways, to keep his statutes, and his commandments, and his judgments, and his testimonies, as it is written in the law of Moses that thou mayest prosper in all that thou doest, and whithersoever thou turnest thyself.

1. Chron. vi. 49. But Aaron and his sons offered upon the altar of the burnt offering, and on the altar of incense, *and were appointed* for all the work of the *place* most holy, and to make an atonement for Israel, according to all that Moses the servant of God had commanded.

Ezra iii. 2. Then stood up Jeshua, the son of Jozadak, and his brethren the priests, and Zerubbabel the son of Shealtiel, and his brethren, and builded the altar of the God of Israel, to offer burnt offerings thereon, as *it is* written in the law of Moses, the man of God.

Ezra vi. 18. And they set the priests in their divisions, and the Levites in their courses, for the service of God, which *is* at Jerusalem; as it is written in the book of Moses.

Neh. i. 7. We have dealt very corruptly against thee, and have not kept the commandments, nor the statutes, nor the judgments, which thou commandedst thy servant Moses.

Luke xxiv. 27, 44.—27 And beginning at Moses, and all the prophets, he expounded unto them in all the Scriptures the things concerning himself. 44 And he said unto them, These *are* the words which I spake unto

you, while I was yet with you, that all things must be fulfilled which were written in the law of Moses, and *in* the prophets, and *in* the psalms, concerning me.

John v. 45 to 47.—45 Do not think that I will accuse you to the Father: there is *one* that accuseth you, *even* Moses, in whom ye trust. 46 For had ye believed Moses, ye would have believed me: for he wrote of me. 47 But if ye believe not his writings, how shall ye believe my words.

Acts vii. 38. This is he that was in the church in the wilderness with the angel which spoke to him in the Mount Sina, and *with* our fathers: who received the lively oracles to give unto us.

Acts xv. 21. For Moses of old time hath in every city them that preach him, being read in the synagogues every sabbath day.

This declaration is contrary to the Standards.

Confession of Faith, Chap. I., Secs. V. and IX.

V. We may be moved and induced by the testimony of the church to an high and reverent esteem for the Holy Scripture; and the heavenliness of the matter, the efficacy of the doctrine, the majesty of the style, *the consent of all the parts*, the scope of the whole, (which is to give all glory to God,) the full discovery it makes of the only way of man's salvation, the many other incomparable excellencies, *and the entire perfection thereof*, are arguments whereby it doth abundantly evidence itself to be the word of God; yet, notwithstanding, our full persuasion and assurance of the infallible truth, and divine authority thereof, is from the inward work of the Holy Spirit, bearing witness by and with the word in our hearts.

IX. *The infallible rule of interpretation of Scripture is the Scripture itself*; and therefore, when there is a

question about the true and full sense of any scripture, which is not manifold, but one,) it may be searched and) known by other places that speak more clearly.

CHARGE VI.

The Presbyterian Church in the United States of America charges the Rev. Charles A. Briggs, D.D., being a Minister of the said Church and a member of the Presbytery of New York, with teaching that Isaiah is not the author of half of the book that bears his name, which is contrary to direct statements of Holy Scripture and to the essential doctrines of the Standards of the said Church that the Holy Scripture evidences itself to be the word of God by the consent of all the parts, and that the infallible rule of interpretation of Scripture is the Scripture itself.

SPECIFICATION.

In an Inaugural Address, which the said Rev. Charles A. Briggs, D.D., delivered at the Union Theological Seminary in the City of New York, January 20th, 1891, on the occasion of his induction into the Edward Robinson Chair of Biblical Theology, which Address has been published and extensively circulated with the knowledge and approval of the said Rev. Charles A. Briggs, D.D., and has been republished by him in a second edition with a preface and an appendix, there occurs the following sentence:

Page 33, lines 14–15:

“Isaiah did not write half of the book that bears his name.”

This declaration is contrary to direct statements of Scripture:

Matt. iv. 14, 15.—14 That it might be fulfilled which was spoken by Esaias the prophet, saying, 15 The land

of Zabulon, and the land of Nephtalim, *by* the way of the sea, beyond Jordan, Galilee of the Gentiles :

Matt. xii. 17, 18.—17 That it might be fulfilled which was spoken by Esaias the prophet, saying, 18 Behold my servant, whom I have chosen ; my beloved, in whom my soul is well pleased : I will put my Spirit upon him, and he shall shew judgment to the Gentiles.

Luke iii. 4. As it is written in the book of the words of Esaias the prophet, saying, The voice of one crying in the wilderness, Prepare ye the way of the Lord, make his paths straight.

Acts xxviii. 25, 26.—25 And when they agreed not among themselves, they departed, after that Paul had spoken one word, well spake the Holy Ghost by Esaias the prophet unto our fathers, 26 Saying, Go unto this people, and say, Hearing ye shall hear, and shall not understand ; and seeing ye shall see, and not perceive.

John xii. 38, 41.—38 That the saying of Esaias the prophet might be fulfilled, which he spake, Lord, who hath believed our report? and to whom hath the arm of the Lord been revealed? 41 These things said Esaias, when he saw his glory and spake of him.

Rom. x. 16, 20.—16 But they have not all obeyed the gospel. For Esaias saith, Lord, who hath believed our report? 20 But Esaias is very bold, and saith, I was found of them that sought me not ; I was made manifest unto them that asked not after me.

This declaration is contrary to the Standards.

Confession of Faith, Chap. I, Secs. V. and IX.

V. We may be moved and induced by the testimony of the church to an high and reverent esteem for the Holy Scripture ; and the heavenliness of the matter, the efficacy of the doctrine, the majesty of the style, *the consent of all the parts*, the scope of the whole, (which is to give all

glory to God,) the full discovery it makes of the only way of man's salvation, the many other incomparable excellencies, *and the entire perfection thereof, are arguments whereby it doth abundantly evidence itself to be the word of God*; yet, notwithstanding, our full persuasion and assurance of the infallible truth, and divine authority thereof, is from the inward work of the Holy Spirit, bearing witness by and with the word in our hearts.

IX. *The infallible rule of interpretation of Scripture is the Scripture itself*; and therefore, when there is a question about the true and full sense of any scripture, (which is not manifold, but one,) it may be searched and known by other places that speak more clearly.

CHARGE VII.

The Presbyterian Church in the United States of America charges the Rev. Charles A. Briggs, D.D., being a minister of said Church, and a member of the Presbytery of New York, with teaching that the processes of redemption extend to the world to come in the case of many who die in sin; which is contrary to the essential doctrine of Holy Scripture and the Standards of the said Church, that the processes of redemption are limited to this world.

SPECIFICATION.

In an Inaugural Address, which the said Rev. Charles A. Briggs, D.D., delivered at the Union Theological Seminary in the City of New York, January 20th, 1891, on the occasion of his induction into the Edward Robinson Chair of Biblical Theology, which Address has been published and extensively circulated with the knowledge and approval of the said Rev. Charles A. Briggs, D.D., and has

been republished by him in a second edition with a preface and an appendix, there occur the following sentences :

Page 50: " The processes of redemption ever keep the *race* in mind. The Bible tells us of a race origin, a race sin, a race ideal, a race Redeemer, and a race redemption."

Page 53: (c.) Another fault of Protestant theology is in its limitation of the process of redemption to this world, and its neglect of those vast periods of time which have elapsed for most men in the Middle State between death and the resurrection."

Pages 55 and 56. " The Bible does not teach universal salvation, but it does teach the salvation of the world, of the race of man, and that cannot be accomplished by the selection of a limited number of individuals from the mass. The holy arm that worketh salvation does not contract its hand in grasping only a few; it stretches its loving fingers so as to comprehend as many as possible—a definite number, but multitudes that no one can number. The salvation of the world can only mean the world as a whole, compared with which the unredeemed will be so few and insignificant, and evidently beyond the reach of redemption by their own act of rejecting it and hardening themselves against it, and by descending into such depths of demoniacal depravity in the Middle State, that they will vanish from the sight of the redeemed as altogether and irredeemably evil, and never more disturb the harmonies of the saints."

Inaugural Address, Appendix, 2d ed.

Page 104. This raises the question whether any man is irretrievably lost ere he commits this unpardonable sin, and whether those who do not commit it in this world ere they die are, by the mere crisis of death, brought into an

unpardonable state; and whether, when Jesus said that this sin against the Holy Spirit was unpardonable here and also hereafter, he did not imply that all other sins might be pardoned hereafter as well as here.

These declarations are contrary to direct statements of Scripture :

Prov. xi. 7. When a wicked man dieth, *his* expectation shall perish : and the hope of unjust *men* perisheth.

Luke xvi. 22, 23.—22 And it came to pass that the beggar died, and was carried by the angels into Abraham's bosom : the rich man also died, and was buried ; 23 And in hell he lift up his eyes, being in torments, and seeth Abraham afar off, and Lazarus in his bosom.

John viii. 24. For if ye believe not that I am *He*, ye shall die in your sins.

II. Cor. vi. 2. Behold, now *is* the accepted time ; behold, now *is* the day of salvation.

Heb. iv. 7. To-day, if ye will hear his voice, harden not your hearts.

These declarations are contrary to the Standards :
Confession of Faith, Chap. XXXII., Sec. I.

I. The bodies of men, after death, return to dust, and see corruption : but their souls, (which neither die nor sleep), having an immortal subsistence, immediately return to God who gave them. The souls of the righteous, being then made perfect in holiness, are received into the highest heavens, where they behold the face of God in light and glory, waiting for the full redemption of their bodies : *and the souls of the wicked are cast into hell, where they remain in torments and utter darkness, reserved to the judgment of the great day.* Besides these two places for souls separated from their bodies, the Scripture acknowledgeth none.

Larger Catechism.

Q. 83. *What is the communion in glory with Christ, which the members of the invisible church enjoy in this life?*

A. The members of the invisible church have communicated to them, in this life, the first-fruits of glory with Christ, as they are members of him their head, and so in him are interested in that glory which he is fully possessed of; and as an earnest thereof, enjoy the sense of God's love, peace of conscience, joy in the Holy Ghost, and hope of glory. As, on the contrary, sense of God's revenging wrath, horror of conscience, and a fearful expectation of judgment, are to the wicked the beginning of the torments, which they shall endure after death.

Q. 86. *What is the communion in glory with Christ, which the members of the invisible church enjoy immediately after death?*

A. The communion in glory with Christ, which the members of the invisible church enjoy immediately after death, is in that their souls are then made perfect in holiness, and received into the highest heavens, where they behold the face of God in light and glory; waiting for the full redemption of their bodies, which even in death continue united to Christ, and rest in their graves as in their beds, till at the last day they be again united to their souls.

Whereas the souls of the wicked are at their death cast into hell, where they remain in torments and utter darkness; and their bodies kept in their graves, as in their prisons until the resurrection and judgment of the great day.

CHARGE VIII.

The Presbyterian Church in the United States of America charges the Rev. Charles A. Briggs, D.D., being a Minister of the said Church and a member of the

Presbytery of New York, with teaching that Sanctification is not complete at death, which is contrary to the essential doctrine of Holy Scripture and of the Standards of the said Church that the souls of believers are at their death at once made perfect in holiness.

SPECIFICATION.

In an Inaugural Address, which the said Rev. Charles A. Briggs, D.D., delivered at the Union Theological Seminary in the City of New York, January 20th, 1891, on the occasion of his induction into the Edward Robinson Chair of Biblical Theology, which Address has been published and extensively circulated with the knowledge and approval of the said Rev. Charles A. Briggs, D.D., and has been republished by him in a second edition with a preface and an appendix, there occur the following sentences :

Pages 53, 54, 55 :

“(c.) Another fault of Protestant theology is in its limitation of the process of redemption to this world, and its neglect of those vast periods of time which have elapsed for most men in the Middle State between death and the resurrection. The Roman Catholic Church is firmer here, though it smears the Biblical doctrine with not a few hurtful errors. The reaction against this limitation, as seen in the theory of second probation, is not surprising. I do not find this doctrine in the Bible, but I do find in the Bible the doctrine of a Middle State of conscious higher life in the communion with Christ and the multitude of the departed of all ages; and of the necessity of entire sanctification, in order that the work of redemption may be completed. There is no authority in the Scriptures, or in the creeds of Christendom, for the doctrine of immediate sanctification at death. The only sanctification known to experience, to Christian orthodoxy, and to the Bible, is progressive sanctification. Progressive

sanctification after death, is the doctrine of the Bible and the Church; and it is of vast importance in our times that we should understand it, and live in accordance with it. The bugbear of a judgment immediately after death, and the illusion of a magical transformation in the dying hour, should be banished from the world. They are conceits derived from the Ethnic religions, and without basis in the Bible or Christian experience as expressed in the symbols of the Church. The former makes death a terror to the best of men, the latter makes human life and experience of no effect; and both cut the nerves of Christian activity and striving after sanctification. Renouncing them as hurtful, unchristian errors, we look with hope and joy for the continuation of the processes of grace, and the wonders of redemption in the company of the blessed, to which the faithful are all hastening.”

Inaugural Address, Appendix, 2d ed., pages 107, 108, “ Sanctification has two sides—a negative and a positive—mortification and vivification; the former is manward, the latter is Godward. Believers who enter the middle state, enter guiltless; they are pardoned and justified; they are mantled in the blood and righteousness of Christ; and nothing will be able to separate them from His love. They are also delivered from all temptations such as spring from without, from the world and the devil. They are encircled with influences for good such as they have never enjoyed before. But they are still the same persons, with all the gifts and graces, and also the same habits of mind, disposition, and temper they had when they left the world. Death destroys the body. It does not change the moral and religious nature of man. It is unpsychological and unethical to suppose that the character of the disembodied spirit will all be changed in the moment of death. It is the Manichean heresy to hold that sin belongs to the physical organization and is laid aside with the body. If this were so, how can any of our race carry their evil

natures with them into the middle state and incur the punishment of their sins? The eternal punishment of a man whose evil nature has been stripped from him by death and left in the grave, is an absurdity. The Plymouth Brethren hold that there are two natures in the redeemed—the old man and the new. In accordance with such a theory, the old man might be cast off at death. But this is only a more subtle kind of Manicheism, which has ever been regarded as heretical. Sin, as our Saviour teaches, has its source in the heart—in the higher and immortal part of man. It is the work of sanctification to overcome sin in the higher nature.”

These declarations are contrary to Scripture :

1 Cor. xv. 51, 52.—51 Behold, I shew you a mystery ; We shall not all sleep, but we shall all be changed. 52 In a moment, in the twinkling of an eye, at the last trump : for the trumpet shall sound, and the dead shall be raised incorruptible, and we shall be changed.

Heb. xii. 23. To the general assembly and church of the first born, which are written in heaven, and to God the Judge of all, and to the spirits of just men made perfect.

These declarations are contrary to the Standards :

Confession of Faith, Chap. XXXII., Sec. I.

I. The bodies of men, after death, return to dust, and see corruption ; *but their souls* (which neither die nor sleep), having an immortal subsistence, *immediately return to God who gave them.* *The souls of the righteous being then made perfect in holiness, are received into the highest heavens, where they behold the face of God in light and glory, waiting for the full redemption of their bodies : and the souls of the wicked are cast into hell, where they*

remain in torments and utter darkness, reserved to the judgment of the great day. Besides these two places for souls separated from their bodies, the Scripture acknowledgeth none.

Larger Catechism.

Q. 86. *What is the communion in glory with Christ, which the members of the invisible church enjoy immediately after death?*

A. The communion in glory with Christ, which the members of the invisible church *enjoy immediately after death, is in that their souls are then made perfect in holiness, and received into the highest heavens, where they behold the face of God in light and glory*; waiting for the full redemption of their bodies, which even in death continue united to Christ, and rest in their graves as in their beds, till at the last day they be again united to their souls. Whereas the souls of the wicked are at their death cast into hell, where they remain in torments and utter darkness; and their bodies kept in their graves, as in their prisons, until the resurrection and judgment of the great day.

Shorter Catechism.

Q. 37. *What benefit do believers receive from Christ at their death.*

A. *The souls of believers are at their death made perfect in holiness, and do immediately pass into glory*; and their bodies, being still united to Christ, do rest in their graves till the resurrection.

The Presbyterian Church in the United States of America, represented by the undersigned Prosecuting Committee, offers in evidence the whole of the said Inaugural Address, both the first and second editions, and all the works of the said Rev. Charles A. Briggs, D.D., quoted therein, in so far as they bear upon this case; also the appendix to the second edition of said Address, and all the works of the said Rev. Charles A. Briggs, D.D., quoted therein, in so far as they bear upon this case; the whole of the Holy Scriptures and the whole of the Standards of the Presbyterian Church in the United States of America.

GEORGE W. F. BIRCH, D.D.,

JOSEPH J. LAMPE, D.D.,

ROBERT F. SAMPLE, D.D.,

JOHN J. STEVENSON,

JOHN J. McCOOK,

Prosecuting Committee.

